



Comparing assessments

Comparing assessments

As a HBDI® Certified Practitioner you will probably be asked the following questions at some point:

- Does HBDI measure the same thing as XYZ assessment?
- How is the HBDI Profile different from XYZ profile?
- Can HBDI be used along with XYZ assessment?
- Why use HBDI compared to other assessments?

Responding to these questions requires you to have enough information on other assessments to make a comparison. There are four main questions you can consider to help you respond to these and other questions that may arise. The questions below provide a framework that will help you understand the differences and similarities between tools, how tools can compliment each other or confuse participants and enable you to respond to most questions regarding tools you are asked about.

What is the intention of the tool?

The intention is the intended measure of the tool. Different tools purport to measure different constructs. Below is a list of different constructs tools claim to measure and their definitions. A company's website should help you determine a tool's intention. It should clearly state what their tool intends to measure, however, sometimes it is not clear.

Thinking (cognition): The process of using one's mind to consider or reason about something. There is no universal model to explain an individual's thinking processes.

Behavior: Behavior refers to the actions and mannerisms made by a person in conjunction with their environment. Behavior is an observational construct.

Emotions: A natural instinctive state of mind deriving from one's circumstances, mood, or relationships with others. No definitive emotion classification system exists, though numerous taxonomies have been proposed. Emotion is a construct that interacts with the environment.

Personality: The combination of characteristics or qualities that form an individual's distinctive character. It is a stable construct.

Intelligence (cognitive ability): is an ability to acquire and apply knowledge and skills including, abstract thought, understanding, self-awareness, communication, reasoning, learning, having emotional knowledge, retaining, planning and problem solving. Often the definition is contentious. Intelligence is proposed as a fairly stable construct.

What is the theory and who developed it?

Even if the intention of the tool is clear there are different theories that purport how that construct (eg personality) works and functions. For example two different personality theories are the five-factor model* and the Carl Jung theory of personality**. To decide which you would use, you might like to consider the reputation of the theorist, the plausibility of the theory, the research behind the theory.

Tools based on sound and simple theories are easier to understand and thus communicate to participants, compared to tools based on complicated or unclear theories.

A company's website should provide information on the theory upon which their tool is based on and who developed it.

The premise of the theory

The premise is the argument behind the tool's intended measure, it is the assertion the tool makes in measurement. Different tools make different assertions. This can be more difficult to ascertain from website research, and sometimes a more detailed knowledge of the tool is required, but some general premises include:

- Dichotomous preferences (either or) eg MBTI.
- Strengths and weaknesses eg LSI.
- Degree of preference eg HBDI.

You may like to think whether these assertions align with your beliefs and thinking.

Application of the tool

Based on the information obtained you are now in a position to judge and explain the best application for a variety of tools. Their uses and limits. Does the application match the intended measure? Does the premise align with your beliefs? What is the theory behind the tool and is it simple to communicate? Would there be stronger applications and weaker applications of a certain tool. Could a combination of tools help with a certain application? These questions also help us understand the power and differentiation of the HBDI.

* http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Big_Five_personality_traits

** http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Carl_Jung

Comparing assessments

THE TOOL	THE INTENTION	THE THEORY	THE PREMISE	THE APPLICATION	+ AND -
The instrument	The intended measurement construct	The theorist and their theory	The premise or argument upon which the theory and construct are based	The uses and applications	Advantages and disadvantages of tools
HBDI®	Thinking	<p>Ned Herrmann's Whole Brain® Model.</p> <p>A metaphor based on physiological and neuro scientific information on how the brain prefers to think.</p>	We have a preference for thinking in four modes, identified by the Whole Brain® Model. (A,B,C,D).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual development • Decision making • Working in a team • Communication • Teaching and learning • Creativity 	<p>+ Self-directed, know self best</p> <p>+ Vast applications</p> <p>+ Model provides development capacity</p> <p>+ Scalable</p> <p>- Thinking-based so others can't report for participant</p>
MBTI	Personality	<p>Carl Jung: Psychological type theory.</p> <p>There are two basic functions which humans use in their lives – how we take on information and how we make decisions.</p>	Our personality is a stable construct that can be categorised in 4 dichotomous preferences based on how we perceive the world and make decisions. (E/I; S/N; T/F; J/P).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Individual development • Team dynamics 	<p>+ Self-directed, know self best</p> <p>+ Understand personal interactions</p> <p>- Little capacity to develop</p> <p>- Pigeonholing or labeling</p> <p>- Complexity of theory thus data</p>
DISC	Behaviour	<p>William Marston Four factor model.</p> <p>Can be categorized as behavior towards the environment (open/guarded) and own behavior (active/passive).</p>	Combining the axis of Marston's model behavior can be grouped into four major styles that each individual possesses but to differing extents. The determination of blend starts with the 'primary' style followed by a 'lesser' style. It is directly observable. (DISC).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sales • Selection 	<p>+ Observable. Others can see and identify</p> <p>+/- Context specific</p> <p>- Cannot identify what contributes to behavior</p> <p>- Can wear a mask</p>
WISC	Intelligence	<p>Spearman/Cattell-Horn-Carroll G-factor model.</p> <p>Intelligence is a general cognitive ability that can be measured and expressed numerically.</p>	The core of human intelligence can be measured by performance on abstract reasoning tasks in which we are competent or not.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Learning • Cognitive achievement 	<p>+ Measure independent of self-assessment</p> <p>- Pigeonholing or labeling</p>



herrmann



herrmann



herrmannintl

Herrmann International, Inc.

P.O. Box 389
Forest City NC, 28043
Phone: (828) 348-6391
thinkherrmann.com